

Final Technical Report

Research Support Project #106361

**Title: Social impacts of the use and regulation of personal data in LA*

***By:** Rodrigo José Firmino
Fernanda Glória Bruno
Marta Mourão Kanashiro
Rafael Evangelista
Danilo Cesar Maganhoto Doneda
Liliane da Costa Nascimento
Nelson Arteaga Botello
Hiram R. Piña Libien
Vanessa L. Lara Carmona
Juan Carlos León y Ramirez
Pablo Sánchez

Report Type: *research study*

***Date:** *December 2011*

***IDRC Project Number:** *Research Support Project #106361*

***IDRC Project Title:** *Social impacts of the use and regulation of personal data in LA*

***Country/Region:** *Mexico-Brasil / Latin America*

***Full Name of Research Institution:** *Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México*

***Address of Research Institution:**

Facultad de Ciencias Políticas y Sociales.
Number and Street or PO Box: Cerro de Coatepec, Ciudad Universitaria/sin número.
District, City: Toluca
Province/State: Estado de México
Country: México
Postal Code: 50100

***Contact Information of Researcher/Research Team members:**

Telephone number (include country and area codes): 011 52 722 2 15 92 80, 011
52 1 722 14 79 720
Facsimile number (include country and area codes): 011 52 722 2 13 16 07
E-mail address: arbnelson@yahoo.com, vanessa.lara.carmona@gmail.com

***This report is presented as received from project recipient(s). It has not been subjected to peer review or other review processes.** 13

i) Basic Project Information

Title Page:

Social impacts of the use and regulation of personal data in LA

Abstract:

This research support project seeks to act as a first step in promoting public debate and influencing public policy on the issue of the protection of personal data in Latin America. We intended to take this path by identifying knowledge based on academic research and disseminating the information obtained about the links between the current state of protection of personal data and certain sorting processes that negatively impact participation of individuals in public life. At this early stage the project focuses on two countries: Brazil and Mexico and focuses three areas: a) national identification documents, b) video surveillance in public spaces, and c) Internet.

It also provided the contextual research needed to develop a full-fledged research project that would target specific activities of personal data collection and available policy-windows in the region. Complementing the research activities, the project consolidated a new academic research network in the region focused on issues regarding personal data.

Keywords: Surveillance, Data Protection, Latin America, Citizenship

ii) The Research Problem

The research project focused on the very first problem to be solved: several Latin American countries have made actions - and implemented technologies - which focused forms of collection, storage and management of citizens' personal data. In this sense, the specificities of the Latin American context are: a) poor-and even a lack of legislation governing the collection, storage and management of personal data and b) a limited public debate and studies that question this scenario and be able to promote citizen participation.

iii) Objectives

The project aimed to be a first step in approach to this reality (research problem) and produce a report about this scenario to start a public debate and influence public

policies concerning personal data protection in Latin America. We intended to map the situation in two countries, Brazil and Mexico, with a view to make it visible by identifying knowledge based on academic research, actors and technologies involved in this scenario, legislation and other speeches about these issues. Disseminating the information obtained about current state of protection of personal data and certain sorting processes that impact participation of individuals in public life. At this early stage the project focused on these countries: Brazil and Mexico and observed three areas: a) national identification documents, b) video surveillance in public spaces, and c) monitoring data on Internet.

This goal was guided from the perception that in both countries, Brazil and Mexico, have made actions - and implemented technologies - which focused forms of collection, storage and management of citizens personal data. Despite this scenario of everyday use of technologies that allow surveillance, we can note a) poor-and even alack of legislation governing the collection, storage and management of personal data and b) a limited public debate and studies that question this scenario and be able to promote citizen participation.

In many areas such as civil identification, installation of circuit video surveillance and data collection and control over the Internet, data processing actions were justified, almost unilaterally, for reasons of public security or arguments whose logic is technocratic, efficiency, administrative or business. This has meant that there was little or no due consideration of the effects the poor or absent regulation of such actions pose to their high invasive potential. In summary, this project aimed to reverse this situation in the direction of greater citizen participation in public debates and interference in the legislation on the subject.

The project's general objective was to lay the foundation for the promotion of a public debate and influencing public policy on the issue of the protection of personal data in Latin America.

The specific objectives were:

1. To improve the knowledge of the policies and practices on the treatment of personal data in Latin America and their possible connection with the forms of inclusion and exclusion of citizens in public life in Mexico and Brazil;
2. To consolidate the Latin American Surveillance Studies Network;
3. Develop a proposal for a LAC-base research project.

We feel that we have satisfactorily reached the objectives stated, since we have gained ample knowledge of the problems of interest. We have gathered information into a Complete Report which details findings on research and the Latin American Surveillance Studies Network advancing in the consolidation of how it functions

through the participation in national and international academic events so that in the coming months, we are in a position to present the proposal of a larger project.

The circulation of our Complete Report is taking place by uploading the document to a web page created within the framework of the research project itself, and at the same time, we are taking the necessary administrative steps to make public our results in an electronic magazine entitled Surveillance & Society. It has also been, and will continue to be possible to publicize the results through researcher's discussions in international forums, such as Congreso Latinoamericano de Sociología ALAS 2011, which took place last September 2011 in Recife, Brazil. In addition, these forms of knowledge exchange between academics will continue through their participation in forums such as the next Foro de Sociología de ISA in 2012 in Argentina.

Active participation in these types of events, not only has as an objective the circulation our Research Report, but also has been a key factor in achieving another one of our objectives consisting of consolidating the Latin American Surveillance Studies Network and having the elements to create research projects used in the region. In regards to these two points, we have also made our workshops an efficient means of communication and exchange of ideas, opinions and advances.

In regards to the potential impact in public policies, we are defining recommendations for legislators in the areas of personal data protection in Latin America, based on the findings included in our Complete Report. We cannot evaluate the real results of this possible impact, due to the timing in the legislator's calendars. However, we don't consider this as a disadvantage, but as an opportunity for a follow-up and continuance of our activities as an academic network.

iv) Methodology

The methodological proposal of the research was based on two central considerations. The first consisted of creating research as an interdisciplinary effort in which people who studied social sciences with specialties in sociology, communication, law, political science, urban planning and anthropology are involved.

Secondly, there is an actual condition in Latin America which lets us think in regards to problems shared both by Brazil and Mexico, allowing the possibility of scaling up the project and including, in previous research, other countries of the region: the phenomenon and processes linked to the significant increase of criminal violence, as well as the increase in the demand for public and private security services, and reforms on public security policies. This context has encouraged an expansion in the use of electronic surveillance equipment in Latin America in different spaces of everyday life, which favor the collection, organization and specific information analysis for controlling those sectors which are thought to be responsible for criminal violence; the excluded and marginalized in large Latin-American cities.

Based on these considerations, the strategies used were the following:

Contextual Mapping:

Contextual mapping of the policies and practices on personal data management and use in Latin America, with a focus on the three areas outlined above. Among other things, we aimed to chart both (i) the context of emergence of the technologies to understand the competing forces that shaped the existing policy environment, and (ii) the effects of social classification resulting from these policies. Finally, the contextual mapping focused on the identification of existing policy influence windows of opportunity.

Workshops:

Two workshops were held to consolidate the network and provide a concrete space for (i) the planning of the mapping research, (ii) sharing of results of the research, and (iii) collaborative development of a research proposal. The development of the proposal is, of course, largely based upon the findings from the mapping research.

v) *Project Activities*

1.- Preliminary mapping:

- a) Documentary and bibliographic research about the Project topics, covering theoretical texts and academic, judicial, administrative, corporative and journalistic documents, as well as others that may include relevant data about the areas in which this preliminary mapping is focused on.

The mapping of the three topics included in the research –documents of national identification; video-surveillance in public spaces and data surveillance on Internet-uses, in general terms, a common methodology for gathering data. This methodology consists on identifying studies and researches, legislation (in action, as well as legal projects), actors (individual and collective), social movements, protests in the mass media and technologies, in each one of the mentioned areas.

During the mapping of each one of these three topics, the collected data was included in worksheets using Excell (regarding each identified element) for further analysis. These documents are in a standard format with some modifications for each case. The data was analysed using descriptive statistics, supported by the use of collected data visualization strategies, including the creation of graphics and CG. Parting from this analysis, a new relationship between variables was established, as well as the possibility to observe the tendencies in all the collected information, developing formulas about the observed and phenomenon and stating hypothesis for future research.

Part of the subsidy funds were assigned to pay the technical support personnel, as well as that in charge of collecting data for viability or the mapping, which in many cases involved large amounts of data that had to be gathered, classified and analysed. Also included was funding for the creation of the Internet page of the Latinamerican surveillance studies network. It is important to point out that this budget assignment was quite convenient and valuable for the research, since it allowed a precise collection and treatment of the data, which has significantly contributed to the formation of the students who used it, providing them with an introduction to the analytic and methodological bases of the research, as well as the opportunity to learn about the topics which were part of it.

It is also important to mention the assignment of financial funds for the service of data visualization, which was carried out by the personnel linked to Medialab/ Sciences Po (Paris, France) and the Laboratorio de Densidad (Milano, Italy). This team figured out the estimates and developed the graphics and CG which allowed the identification of tendencies and the statistic-descriptive analysis of the studied phenomenon. We highlight, therefore, the big advantage of the use of data visualization techniques in research, such as in ours, which include data, processes' and actors' registration. In methodological terms, these visual works were created to organize the complexity of collected data, facilitated our perceptions and inferences in regards to the registered information. In addition to “translating” the information from the worksheets to a format of easy visual perception and understanding, makes the research results more legible and comprehensible, which is of great importance both for the circulation of the results among a wider audience as to influence actors and pertinent politics.

- a) Open interviews carried out personally or by telephone, to the main generators of knowledge of a specific topic.

In the case of Mexico, the funds to support the research, in addition to the creation of data bases for the mapping, were also used to interview the personnel that work at the Unidad de Información y Análisis de la Procuraduría General de Justicia del Estado de México (PGJEM). October, 2010.

This unit is a space for research. Among their given attributions, the following ones stand out: a) designing methods and collection, processing, analysis and classification procedures, b) establishing systems of information exchange with other authorities from the judicial and federal fields –such as Pataforma México and the Sistema Nacional de Seguridad Pública- as well as other federative entities; c) determining the updating and consultation systems of information for the Sistema Único de Información Criminal, and the Registro de Personal de Seguridad Pública, among others; d) exercising the necessary faculties for the requirement of information and data, which the concessionaires of public networks of telecommunications have.

The talks given to the personnel from this unit took place with the intention of learning how the Unidad de Análisis operates, the organization of the work within the unit, as well as to know about the knowledge and experience the workers and their superiors have in the collection, organization, storing and use of the personal data obtained.

What was learned from this activity strengthened our knowledge about the topic of regulation of personal data. In specific about the ease with which we can access, as academic researchers, “sensitive” and delicate data, since we had permission to carry out the mentioned interviews. However, we keep insisting in order to have access to printed documents to reinforce the obtained information. Access in this case is limited.

- a) A preliminary survey by internet, with a small sample dealing with issues related to the handling of data and net privacy; and another survey by internet directed to active net users and shapers of public opinion.

In Brasil, the topic of internet surveillance also includes a preliminary research about the perception of cybernauts, in regards to the use and protection of their data on the internet. A questionnaire was given with the objective to test the suitability of the questions that will be used in future research. At this moment, the structured sample was not used, since it is planned for the next phase of the project. The questionnaire should be re-formulated according to the results of the current phase.

2. Organization, exchange and circulation.

a) *Workshops:*

An important part of the research project was to exchange and circulate the information and analysis among the members of the Net. Therefore, the second group of areas which are assigned economical resources was the one related to the organization and the execution of work meetings.

The first Net meeting, after having established contact with IDRC, took place in August, 2010 in the city of Curitiba, Brasil. Resources from the Pontificia Universidad Católica de Paraná (PUCPR) and the Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México were used. That work meeting was oriented to discuss and specify the detailed planning for each of the activities referred in the methodology. Subsequently, in December 2010, another meeting took place in the city of Toluca, Mexico. On that occasion, the assigned funds from the IDRC were most useful to cover all the expenses for the logistics. The implications of that meeting were quite meaningful, having as important results:

- a) The presentation of advances in the mapping for each topic of the project, and for each country; b) The establishing of a work scheme and an ample report for the final

results, for each objective and activity within the project; c) The establishing of the central topic for a future project of larger implications and longer in its duration.

The information gained from the Network at that point was meaningful in the way in which it was possible to have a more efficient and clearer communication between members, to specify each particular form of work, as well as the way in which each researcher understood the work he was carrying out.

The distance between Brasil and Mexico does not allow the members of the Network to get together frequently, even though we would like to. That is the reason why the usefulness of such meetings was to shape up the lines of work, in order to reach similar results and join efforts.

b) *The construction of a website:*

The circulation of the project has been done through the creation of a website. It works as a repository of information and database on the subject in Latin America. This site has the objective to promote public debate about the topics developed by the Red Latinoamericana de Estudios sobre Vigilancia, making the report of this research available for the public, and also circulating the research documents produced individually by researchers who participate in the Net.

On the other hand, the site tries to locate news and events that may be of the interest of the researchers and the public in general, and which can contribute to the debate about surveillance issues, the biometric identification of people and data protection on the Internet. Taking into account this intention, there is not a specific focus on the Latin American region in the news. This is being covered through the work of the grant holder Cristiane Kampf, under her professor's orientation Dr. Rafael de Almeida Evangelista and with the financing of the program José Reiss from Incentivos al Periodismo Científico de la Fundación de Apoyo a la Investigación de Sao Paulo (FAPESP).

Built using *Wordpress* (a free publication platform), the website was divided into seven sections. Six of them have links organized in a horizontal bar at the upper part of the page. These are: Inicio, Eventos, Publicaciones, Investigación, Equipo y Contacto (Home, Events, Publications, Research, Members and Contact). At the right hand-side of the page, you can find the section Noticias (News), which contains articles about the works made by the Net, as well as relevant investigations developed by other researchers.

The site also allows the collaboration online between net members, this communication being invisible to the general public and offering a collective work platform free and independent of commercial services. The structure is available in Portuguese and the texts containing general information on the Net is translated into Spanish and English.

A part of the web page content (especially events and research which are more dynamic) can be updated by any member of the Net who has a user ID and password. The goal is to train all of the Net members on maintaining and updating the site.

The current URL is <http://www.labor.unicamp.br/vigilancia/>, and the site content is stored on the Laboratorio de Estudios Avanzados en Periodismo de la Universidad Estatal de Campinas (Sao Paulo, Brasil) servers.

c) Consolidation of the Network and Approach of a larger project proposal:

The consolidation of the Network has been done through two groups of actions. The first one is through the spreading of our findings using the website, as well as through the administration undertaken up to this point for the publishing of the information in the electronic magazine *Surveillance & Society*, which not only highly pertains to our research, but also has an important relation with David Lyon, a professor and world-renowned surveillance expert at Queen's University in Kingston, Ontario, who also acts as a consultant on the project and plays a fundamental role in the theoretical and technical consultation.

The second one, through the consolidation of the Network, is represented by work meetings that were carried out, which as mentioned earlier, favored teamwork. On the other hand, both the spreading and consolidation of the Network is constructed from participation in international forums such as the Congreso Latinoamericano de Sociología ALAS 2011, which took place last September 2011 in Recife, Brazil, and coming up next, the Foro de Sociología de ISA in August of 2012 in Argentina.

We have not considered funds from the Project to cover for these events, but were included as activities derived from it, since the Network researchers have taken advantage of the opportunity to participate in them, in order to present our findings, to discuss them with colleagues from other countries and therefore be able to enrich our perspectives, to determine the design of a bigger project in the following months.

The general lines of this Project were profiled during the December 2010 Network meeting and currently we are working to define its details. This work has not yet been completed as we would like to have a general panorama of results in order to make decisions with respect to what the priorities of the second project will be which deepens the analysis on surveillance and personal data in Latin America.

d) Potential impact on Public Policies:

As referred to earlier, with the potential impact on public policies, we constructed and submitted recommendation documents for legislators which concerned the protection

of personal data in Latin America. These documents are derived from the large report which we are submitting together with this technical report. Therefore, the results of this action cannot be evaluated at this moment but the study and analysis which was done in the larger project, allowed us to know to a certain degree, if our ideas have influenced the orientation of policies for personal data regulation.

vi) Project Outputs

Research:

1) The Final Research Report

This document (being handed to the IDRC together with this Technical Report) is being considered by the researchers involved with this study as the main outcome or principal document. The report describes and critically assesses some of the many results and information gathered with the first broad scope study made about surveillance in Mexico and Brazil. The descriptions and analyses are concentrated in three main aspects of the surveillance society in Latin America: a) Documents and identification schemes, b) video surveillance in public spaces, and c) surveillance of personal data on the Internet.

2) The construction of an unprecedented network in Latin America

The experience of producing a joint and well-integrated cross-national study with multiple teams within Mexico and Brazil, located in different places and institutions was the first step for the enhancement of an unprecedented network about surveillance studies, data protection and other related matters. This networking experience both within the national teams and between the two international groups was the first joint research effort about these subjects in the context of Latin America and it is considered as one of the main achievements of this project. Besides previous experiences of the same group of Mexican and Brazilian scholars working together to organize international events, this first hands-on experience provided the first opportunity for these teams to work together on an empirical-based study.

3) The construction of a website that works as a repository of information and database on the subject in Latin America. At this first moment, the information included is related to legislation about these themes, academic production and news in both countries, Mexico and Brazil, and also the report produced.

The pragmatic outcomes of this process relate to: a) a stronger relationship among the individuals and respective institutions in a network of common research issues; b) the obvious development and sharing of methodologies applied to this research; c) the opportunity to establish milestones in terms of the possible future expansions of the network concerning subjects to be studied and other

international teams to be approached/involved in; d) the increased knowledge about the development and implications of policies and actions related to the three main thematic fields studied in two distinct national scenarios; e) the opportunity to compare research findings in terms of similarities and differences between these two countries; f) and finally, enrich the very academic and scientific context where these subjects are studied in Brazil and Mexico.

Capacity:

1) Individuals trained during the data collection and analysis phases of the project:

a) CCTV

Brazilian team: i) Ana Cláudia Cardoso Santiago, architect, MPhil in Urban Management, worked during data collection, the organization of the information as evidences in spreadsheets and graphics, coordinated field work; ii) Vanessa Cardoso Molino, architect, worked during data collection and helped in the construction of the spreadsheets, both coordinated by Rodrigo F. Firmino. Molino will present part of this work in the Seminário de Iniciação Científica – SEMIC (Scientific Initiation Seminar) which takes place at the Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Paraná in October 2011.

Molino, Vanessa; Firmino, Rodrigo (2011). Sistema de monitoramento e videovigilância: espaços públicos e espaços privados de uso público em Curitiba. In: XIX Seminário de Iniciação Científica, SEMIC. Curitiba: PUCPR.

a.1) Participation in the APC (Association for Progressive Communication) Networking and Learning Forum. One of the research leaders of the international groups, Dr. Rodrigo José Firmino, was sent to attend the forum in order to gain experience in communicating research findings and to network with other groups studying similar subject or other subjects with similar approaches. Some of these groups, and in fact the forum itself, have the IDRC as partner and sponsor.

Mexican team: i) Lic. Guadalupe Quiroz Cartagena, Sociologist, worked during data collection, the organization of the information as evidences in spreadsheets and graphics The team was coordinated by Nelson Arteaga Botello.

b) Identification schemes

Brazilian team: i) Ana Paula Camelo, journalist, MSc in Scientific and Cultural Dissemination, worked during data collection, the organization of the information and field work coordinated by Marta M. Kanashiro.

Mexican team: i) Lic. Sara Cristina González Ceballos, she worked during the informational organization and writing of the report about the Cédula de

Identidad Personal for minors. ii) PS Alicia Guzmán Portillo, worked during data collection and the organization of information. The team was coordinated by Vanessa Lara.

a) Personal data on the Internet,

Brazilian team: i) Liliane da Costa Nascimento, journalist, doctorate holder by the UFRJ. She worked in data collection, result analysis, chart creation and CG's, coordination of grant holders in charge of technical support and the writing of the IDRC report, ii) Thiago Correa Cesar, Computer Science graduate. He worked as part of the technical support team in the treating of data and the development of search mechanisms and automatic data classification, iii) Renata Palladino Costa, Masters Student of Communications by the UFRJ. She worked as part of the technical support team in data collecting procedures, v) Anna Carolina Bentes, grant holder of scientific initiation by the UFRJ. She worked as part of the technical support team in data collecting procedures. The complete team was coordinated by Fernanda Bruno.

Mexican team: i) Lic. Eduardo Funes, Sociologist. He worked on data collection and the organization of the information as evidences in spreadsheets and graphics; ii) Lic. Pablo Sánchez, student of the Master degree in Administration. He worked during the organization of information and the writing of the Internet report. The team was coordinated by Juan Carlos León Ramírez.

b) 1) Part of the technical support team and data collection in Brasil will give a presentation on a project related to the contents of the investigation.

This project was accepted into the XXXIII Jornada Giulio Massarani de Iniciación Científica, Artística y Cultural of the UFRJ, which will take place in November, 2011. Anna Carolina Bentes, Rafael de Oliveira Lins, Liliane da Costa Nascimento. Personal Data and Brazilian Internet Surveillance: Devices and speeches. In the XXXIII Jornada Giulio Massarani de Iniciación Científica, Artística y Cultural of the Universidad Federal de Rio de Janeiro.

e) Website development team: i) Ronye Pereira Pires, An IT Specialist, worked during website planning and development, coordinated by Marta M. Kanashiro and Rafael A. Evangelista, ii) Cristiane Kämpf, journalist. She was awarded a scholarship for Scientific Journalism by the FAPESP (Fundación de Apoyo a la Investigación del Estado de Sao Paulo) for the project: "Science Communication of The Social Effects of Personal Data Treatment and Regulation in Latin America". For a period of six months (renewable for another six months), she is responsible for writing and publication of the results derived from the project. She will also be in charge of collecting magazine and newspaper articles on related topics.

Policy and practice:

- 1) Executive summary and policy recommendations: From the main report produced as a qualitative output of this study, it will be made shorter and more objective documents to serve as instruments for the improvement of awareness among policy makers and key stakeholders. These have not yet been produced but will be carefully designed and considered as soon as the reports are delivered.
- 2) It is also the intention of this study to approach individuals and groups identified as important social actors during the research in order to inform them of the steps taking during the study and of possible recommendations.

vii) Project Outcomes

It is understood that the project contributed to:

- 1) Academic and scientific knowledge about the state-of-the-art of surveillance studies, legislation, technologies, policies, and market in Mexico and Brazil. It is clear by the main report that many aspects of the field of surveillance studies were found and organized to both countries in terms of quantification and qualification of what has been discussed and produced within the academic environment, the juridical arena, and in the market. Here is a summarized view of the gains in terms of knowledge of these themes:

a) In Brazil:

Within the framework of the new national document for identification in Brasil, there are laws, law projects and discussions in the Congress since 1991, but they mainly refer to its application in an uncritical way, and not in a reflexive one. At the expense of what may be displayed in this intense course, there is no participation or public debate in the country concerning the topic. The research also shows that there is scientific production in the areas of biometrics and identification, centered in exact areas or in those interested in suggesting more efficient technical systems. There are fewer humanistic studies and only a few critical studies that reflect on the topic. In this way, implementation is characterized by a technocratic aspect or in a technical supremacy which eliminates its political characteristics. The analysis of law projects or laws, point out that the application of the documento único de identidad in the country, does not go by the juridic area adequately, and that there are no legal mechanisms in Brasil for the control and supervision of the document itself outside the groups that apply it. In the same way, there is no clear legislative disposition about the access and use of personal data which would be part of the document, and its related data base. In connection with the deployment of the new document, there are new investments in forms of

identification and construction of data bases of the population including ways of accessing information which benefit the government, the electoral and traffic systems, currently taking place in the country. In regards to video surveillance and electronic monitoring systems in Brasil, it was possible to identify the growth and interest tendencies in two main aspects: the technology market for its use in electronic surveillance, and in the studies and research related to the same topic. This growth is explained by the parallel expansion of interests and profitability in the walled-in residential real estate market, which are one of the most common ways of urban soil subdivision, with repercussion in practically all social levels. In such cases, the relation between real estate market and safety and surveillance equipment is latent and symptomatic. In the case of the increase of scientific and academic interest, the number of recent articles and studies on topics related to the use of CCTV is noticeable. The fact stands out that most of the production of critical works on the topic consists in a larger number of theoretical studies, rather than in studies of cases or works with a strong empiric support. Finally, growth in these two aspects contrasts with an “emptiness” in the current legislation and in the discussion of law projects. This study points out the lack of legislation on implications or consequences of the proliferation in the use of closed circuit TV for monitoring citizens, as well as public and private spaces; also the lack of interest in detailing the conditions of application, handling and responsibility in regards to the data produced by the use of these technologies.

Internet mapping in Brasil indicated that Internet users’ personal data is more vulnerable for collecting, controlling and classifying by companies and corporations that produce or operate through “trackers” in their websites, rather than by the data processing and monitoring by State and government institutions. There was a study on Brazilian government efforts (for the past 5 years) to encourage the participation of civil society in public debate about the regulation of personal data, with special attention in the context of data circulation on the Internet. Among these efforts, the Brazilian government proposal stands out, in cooperation with the Fundación Getulio Vargas. It consisted of a law project for the protection of personal data (2010) and a preliminary draft for the creation of an internet civil framework in Brasil (2009), both open for public consultation and collaborative construction. However, such efforts face difficulties before a series of pending projects in the Brazilian Cámara de Representantes y el Senado. We have found that a clear majority of these projects include measures directed to banning anonymity, stating dispositions for users identification, as well as for access control and Internet use. We also identified that these projects threaten the slightest advances in regards to digital inclusion in Brasil, every time the Internet is first and foremost considered as a means for potential criminal acts, more than as a means of communication and production of knowledge and contents oriented to its democratization. Taking these conflicts into account,

we highlight how timely and important it is to encourage the participation of the Brazilian population in the public debate, about the treatment and regulation of personal data in the Internet, since such debate, as it can be identified in the research, is still quite unclear.

a) In Mexico: what we can point out as direct effects of the project, concentrates on the academic and political science fields. In the academic field, we have noticed that our search for information about social effects in data regulation has generated interest in other academic bodies in regards to the topic, specifically in areas such as Sociology and Political Sciences. We have identified academic bodies with similar interests throughout the project; therefore we have established strategies to continue training researchers in the field. We have been doing it through the creation of research workshops for under graduate students. The general subject matter in the workshops is the same as in our research project, and currently there are 4 theses basing their topic on the subject matter. On the other hand, during our research process we have widened institutional links with other Mexican state universities and abroad, which has made it easier for us to understand the perspective of the legal system in the topic of data protection. This has been possible thanks to the participation of the research professor and lawyer Hiram Piña Libián, who has created the sections linked to normativity within the three areas of the project, for the case of Mexico. In the same way, Dr. Hiram has supported sociologists and political scientists from the Mexican team, in order to encourage their abilities for analysis from a perspective different from our own disciplines, which has enriched the presentation of our findings and will strengthen the actions of our team in the future.

b) What was learned from our participation in the APC Networking and Learning Forum? Here is a brief report of what it is considered relevant:

Networking was one of the greatest assets of this event. And this started when there was an opportunity to explain this study about Latin America to people from APC, Privacy International and the IDRC itself (people connected to other regions of the Globe, following different projects). These things were: (a) the project with the IDRC; (b) the ongoing formation of a Latin American network of surveillance studies; (c) about the teams and individuals involved in this network; (d) and major goals as a group and individual researchers. All listeners were very supportive to the future ahead of this attempt to establish the network, leaving an open window of possible collaborations in the future.

As for the event itself, everything was well designed to be very inclusive, democratic and meaningful, despite the short time for every discussion and the variety of backgrounds involved. The aim of our team (represented by Dr. Rodrigo Firmino) there was to find the bridges between academic research and activism or ways of communicating research more effectively in terms of impact in policy-making. As a side effect, there was a clear opportunity to know very good works about grassroots empowerment with the use of ICTs by people from all over the world. The event was organized to discuss six

major subjects, these being:

- Affordable Internet access for all
- Making technology work for environmental sustainability
- Securing and defending Internet rights
- Building the “information commons”
- Improving governance, including the governance of the Internet
- Gender equality and women’s rights

APC stated their vision for these at the beginning, and many different dynamics were set to provide discussions about them and parallel issues related to them, which guided us to later provide a few challenges and opportunities for each topic. Firmino mediated a table and was involved with the final report in 2 topics: "Improving governance, including the governance of the internet" and "Securing and defending internet rights". The results of these discussions can be found at: <http://nlf.apc.org/archives/452>; and <http://nlf.apc.org/archives/459>.

Firmino also participated in small group discussions more directly related to the major interests there, being: Communicating research: Strategies for enhancing the impact of research, Web 2.0 tools to link research and policy, and the overlaps and discrepancies between academic research and activism. There were very good conversations in all these topics and what was clear was that bringing research findings and data to be used and communicated outside academia is a very common sense in terms of its difficulties and a preoccupation to everyone there, from academics to activists.

Firmino exposed his concerns that academics are usually very comfortable communicating and discussing research among themselves (papers, conferences, etc.), but they also lack the ability to overcome the tall and strong walls of this “ivory tower” we call university. It was also agreed that this is not a problem in itself and that it is fine for academics to be doing what they do best: studying, observing, adding up to knowledge. However, certain partnerships could help them forwarding their findings a step further. They could, for example, get used to the idea of planning the communication of their research prior to the bids for resources, and that this could be easily included in the budgets predicting the involvement of partners more prepared to do this kind of work (communicating, lobbying, influencing civil society, etc.). It was also raised that there could be a closer involvement of the public with the research since its beginnings, helping to find the scope and clearer objectives for activism, but it was also argued that in research it isn't always the case of targeting studies for a specific public, and rather that anyone could benefit from the findings and data of a more impartial and impassioned study. Therefore, this was a very important experience in many different ways:

networking and meeting people with similar interests and problems in research and activism; understanding the way APC, PI and more importantly the IDRC position themselves in terms of research and social impact; openly discussing the topics and issues just described; generating an opportunity to think about the very study about Latin America in these respects.

viii) Overall Assessment and Recommendations

As it can be seen in the main report and the initial proposal for this project, this small team of researchers from Brazil and Mexico are only starting to build the basis for a lot more in depth research needed in the field of surveillance in the Latin American context. Many steps were already taken, before and during this study, but it is imperative to say that the opportunity to work together with the support (financial but also personal support such as the constant contact the team had with IDRC agents, especially Dr. Matthew Smith) represented a huge leap forward in at least two main aspects: a) first as an encouragement for the groups dispersed in these two countries to direct their efforts to organize the logistics and institutional arrangements to work together as a proper research centre; b) and secondly, for the gains in terms of the knowledge acquired about the level of development in the three main topics studied regarding the academic and scientific environment, the making and proposal of legislation, the market, the technological status, and the mapping of stakeholders and policy makers involved with these themes.

As lessons learned, for the practical elements involved in a cross-national research like this, it was clear the level of bureaucratic difficulties to use the funds coming from the IDRC, in Canada, directed to the UAEM, in Mexico, and then distributed to other teams in Mexico and Brazil. The financial and administrative engineering of other projects involving international coordination can be better discussed and developed in future opportunities.

On the other hand, we can assume that the investment of time, effort and funding for such a short study was adequate. Little changes could be considered in the future regarding the allocation of more funds for two fronts: a) the realization of more meetings during the period of the research, in order to facilitate integration of data and methodology; b) and a better contribution to the hours spent by leading researchers, as this time is usually taken from their daily activities in their institutions of origin. Therefore, we would like to stress the importance of this contribution to the project made by the IDRC in the way the study was financially funded, and the way the process was closely followed by Dr. Matthew Smith.

The exchanges of information and the support provided by the IDRC in terms of knowledge of other projects and the views about our own, were very appreciated by the teams of researchers involved in this study. This helped the groups visualize very

clearly where the study was going and what everyone's role was. We found both the experience and the results very useful for the continuation of the joint work among the individuals and groups that have taken part on this first scoping research, for the strengthening of the basis for the consolidation of the Latin American network of surveillance studies, for the possible involvement of other Latin American partners in future projects, and for the encouragement for making more in depth studies about Latin American cases.